

"CR"

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP(C) NO. 24058 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 NANDINI K
AGED 54 YEARS
WIFE OF A M MOHAN KUMAR,
'ASHIRWAD', VELLINEZHI, PALAKKAD, PIN - 679504
- 2 A.M. MOHAN KUMAR
AGED 57 YEARS
SON OF O SANKARAN NAIR,
'ASHIRWAD', VELLINEZHI, PALAKKAD, PIN - 679504
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI
A.MEGHA
NAYANPALLY RAMOLA (MAH/6224/2014), AMICUS CURIE

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 THE UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI , PIN - 110001
- 2 THE DIRECTOR
MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI (ADDRESS OF R2 IS
CORRECTED AS THE CHAIRMAN, NATIONAL MEDICAL
COMMISSION, POCKET-14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE-
I, NEW DELHI-110 077 AS PER THE ORDER DATED 29-
07-2022 IN IA NO.1/2022 IN WP(C)
NO.24058/2022.), PIN - 110077
- 3 THE STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM , PIN - 695001
- 4 THE DIRECTOR

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-2-

KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL,
COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM
(ADDRESS OF R4 IS CORRECTED AS THE REGISTRAR,
KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN
MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING,
RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL,
THIRUVANANANTHAPURAM-695 035.

AS PER THE ORDER DATED 29-07-2022 IN IA
NO.1/2022 IN WP(C) NO.24058/2022, PIN - 695035

5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER

DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011

6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADVS.

MALINI K. MENON, CGC

SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL
COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY;

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-3-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 24508 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 K. SNEHALATHA
AGED 57 YEARS
WIFE OF GOPALAKRISHNAN,
'VADAKKUMMURY HOUSE', CHOROTTUR ROAD,
MANISSERI PO, VANIYAMKULAM - II, PALAKKAD, PIN
- 679521
- 2 V. GOPALAKRISHNAN
AGED 64 YEARS
SON OF O SANKARAN NAIR,
'VADAKKUMMURY HOUSE', CHOROTTUR ROAD,
MANISSERI PO, VANIYAMKULAM - II, PALAKKAD, PIN
- 679521
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE CHAIRMAN
NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-4-

- SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 4 THE REGISTRAR
KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN
MEDICINE,
COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN
- 695035
- 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH (RCH)
OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
- 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADVS.
JAGADEESH LAKSHMAN CGC
SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL
COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY;

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C). 25078/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-5-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 25078 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 REEMA V
AGED 39 YEARS
WIFE OF SURENDRAN NAIR,
'KANNAMPLETH', THAZHAVA S W,
THAZHAVA PO, KARUNAGAPPALLY, KOLLAM., PIN -
690523
- 2 SURENDRAN NAIR V.K
AGED 61 YEARS
SON OF KARTHYAYANI AMMA,
'VILAVITH HOUSE', NEAR VILAVITH BHAGAVATHI
TEMPLE,,
VATTAKATTUPADY, ERNAKULAM, PIN - 683542
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE CHAIRMAN
NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-6-

- SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 4 THE REGISTRAR
KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN
MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS
ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035
- 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER,
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
- 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673

BY ADV N.RAGHURAJ, SC
CGC V.GIRISHKUMAR

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU; GP
RIYAL DEVASSY;

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-7-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 26011 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 P. SHEEBA PAUL
AGED 51 YEARS
W/O.SIMON ANTHONY, ELEVATHINGAL, KONNU ROAD,
ANGAMALY P.O., ERNAKULAM., PIN - 683572
- 2 SIMON E.A
AGED 58 YEARS
ELEVATHINGAL, KONNU ROAD, ANGAMALY P.O.,
ERNAKULAM., PIN - 683572
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE CHAIRMAN
NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 4 THE REGISTRAR
KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-8-

MEDICINE,
COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN
- 695035

- 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER,
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN -
682011
- 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADV N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU; GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022, 25078/2022
AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED
THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-9-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 26035 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 USHA ANITHA ABRAHAM
AGED 51 YEARS
WIFE OF RENU THOMAS,
'THAYIL PUTHENVEEDU', THUMPAMON PO,
PANDALAM, PATHANAMTHITTA, PIN - 689572
- 2 RENU THOMAS
AGED 51 YEARS
SON OF P T THOMAS,
'THAYIL PUTHENVEEDU', THUMPAMON PO,
PANDALAM, PATHANAMTHITTA, PIN - 689572
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE CHAIRMAN
NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
HEALTH AND FAMILY WELRAFE DEPARTMENT,
SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 4 THE REGISTRAR

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-10-

KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN
MEDICINE,
COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN
- 695035

5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER, MDISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE,
ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA
, PIN - 682011

6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA.
, PIN - 686673
BY ADVS.
VISHNU RAJAGOPAL
N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU; GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC VISHNU RAJAGOPAL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-11-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 26066 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 KOCHURANI MATHEW
AGED 51 YEARS
WIFE OF ROY JOSEPH,
THEKKEL, KOZHUVANAL P O,
PULIYANNOOR, KOTTAYAM.
, PIN - 686573
- 2 ROY JOSEPH
AGED 54 YEARS
HUSBAND OF KOCHURANI MATHEW,
THEKKEL, KOZHUVANAL P O,
MEENACHIL, KOTTAYAM
, PIN - 686573
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
V.S.VARALEKSHMI
GIRISH KUMAR M S

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE CHAIRMAN
NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-12-

- SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 4 THE REGISTRAR
KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN
MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS
ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035
- 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER,
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
- 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673
BY ADV N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU; GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C). 25078/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-13-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 26559 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 SHYMA
AGED 50 YEARS
WIFE OF UMESH KUMAR,
'KUNNATH HOUSE', PULINTHANAM, ENANALLOOR,
NORTH BEYPORE, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673015
- 2 UMESH KUMAR
AGED 56 YEARS
SON OF INDRANI,
'MADHAVAM', KUNNOTH,
KAKKOTI, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673611
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE CHAIRMAN
NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW
DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE DEPARTMENT,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-14-

- 4 THE REGISTRAR
KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN
MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS
ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035
- 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
- 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADVS.
VISHNU JAYAPALAN
N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC VISHNU J

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-15-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 26563 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 GRACY BENNY
AGED 56 YEARS
WIFE OF BENNY MATHAI,
'PALLITHAZHATHU', PULINTHANAM, ENANALLOOR,
KOTHAMANGALAM, ERNAKULAM , PIN - 686671
- 2 BENNY MATHAI
AGED 57 YEARS
SON OF MATHAI,
'PALLITHAZHATHU', PULINTHANAM, ENANALLOOR,
KOTHAMANGALAM, ERNAKULAM, PIN - 686671
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE CHAIRMAN
NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-16-

- 4 THE REGISTRAR
KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN
MEDICINE,
COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN
- 695035
- 5 5. THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER,
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
- 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADV N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-17-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 27099 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 SHIBYMOL M
AGED 55 YEARS
DAUGHTER OF KAUSALYA MADHAVAN,
'MUKALETHUPARAMBIL', VETTICKAL PO,
THIRUVANIYOOR, MULANTHURUTHY, ERNAKULAM.
, PIN - 682314
- 2 UNNINARAYANAN O
AGED 56 YEARS
SON OF GANGADHARAN NAIR,
'PUNATHIL', CHOOOLUR,
NIT CAMPUS PO, KOZHIKODE
, PIN - 673601
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
1. REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION
REPRESENTED BY THE CHAIRMAN,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-18-

- SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 4 KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE
REPRESENTED BY THE REGISTRAR,
COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN
- 695035
- 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, PIN - 682011
- 6 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD
REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADVS.
Kiran M.S., CGC
SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL
COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY;

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-19-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 27188 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 SHYLEJA S
AGED 48 YEARS
DAUGHTER OF C N SIVAKUMAR,
'CHITTETTU PADINJAREMURIYIL, PATHANAD,
KANGAZHA, KOTTAYAM, PIN - 686541
- 2 HEMANT KUMAR R
AGED 55 YEARS
SON OF R RAMACHANDRAN NAIR,
TC 28/1348, MAIDAN VILLA,
HINDU MISSION ROAD, GPO,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION
REPRESENTED BY THE CHAIRMAN,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-20-

- THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 4 KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE
REPRESENTED BY THE REGISTRAR,
COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN
- 695035
- 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, PIN - 682011
- 6 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD
REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADV SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE
MEDICAL COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU; GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR, N.RAGHURAJ,
SC

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-21-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 27212 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 LAILA
AGED 50 YEARS
DAUGHTER OF ABDUL KHADER,
'MAILADUMPARA PLAVILA VEEDU',
VALIYAKALUNGU, PARANDODE PO, ARYANAND,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695542
- 2 SHAHUL HAMEED A
AGED 61 YEARS
SON OF ABUBAKKAR KUNJU,
'SHAJINA MANZIL', MALAYANTHERI,
PARANDODE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695542
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE CHAIRMAN
NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI , PIN - 110077
- 3 THE STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-22-

- THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 4 THE REGISTRAR
KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN
MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS
ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM
PIN - 695035
- 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
- 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADVS.
S.JUSTUS
SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL
COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU; GP
RIYAL DEVASSY;

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-23-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 27216 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 OMANA M
AGED 50 YEARS
DAUGHTER OF MARY, 'UDAYA BHAVAN',
CHERUVALLY, KEEZHTHONNAKKAL, SANTHIGIRI PO,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695589
- 2 JAYAKUMAR V
AGED 59 YEARS
SON OF VELAYUDHAN PILLAI,
'VEMOOTTILVEEDU', POOLANTHARA,
SANTHIGIRI PO, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695589
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION
REPRESENTED BY THE CHAIRMAN,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW
DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 4 KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-24-

REPRESENTED BY THE REGISTRAR,
COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN
- 695035

5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, PIN - 682011

6 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673
BY ADVS.
N.J.ASHWIN,CGC
SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL
COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY;

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-25-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 29282 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 SANGEETHA JOBY
AGED 51 YEARS
WIFE OF JOBY S URALATH,
'URALATH HOUSE', NANDHI, VELLANI PO,
KARALAM, THRISSUR, PIN - 680701
- 2 JOBY S URALATH
AGED 54 YEARS
SON OF SUBRAMANIAN,
'URALATH HOUSE', NANDHI, VELLANI PO,
KARALAM, THRISSUR, PIN - 680701
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION
REPRESENTED BY THE CHAIRMAN,
POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,
DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077
- 3 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 4 KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-26-

MEDICINE, REPRESENTED BY THE REGISTRAR,
COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR
GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM
REPRESENTED BY THE REGISTRAR,
COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN
- 695035

5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, PIN - 682011

6 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD
REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADV SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE
MEDICAL COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-27-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 29646 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 SHEENA
AGED 41 YEARS
WIFE OF PRAKASAN,
'EDAKKATT HOUSE',
EDAKKARA PO, PUNNAYUR,
THRISSUR, PIN - 680518
- 2 PRAKASAN
AGED 55 YEARS
SON OF VASU,
'EDAKKATT HOUSE',
EDAKKARA PO, PUNNAYUR
THRISSUR, PIN - 680518
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-28-

DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011

4 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADV MINI GOPINATH -CGC .

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY;

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-29-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 30545 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 SUCHITHRA BABU
AGED 48 YEARS
WIFE OF M P BABU,
'CHAITHRAM',
VALLICODE PO,
PATHANAMTHITTA, PIN - 689642
- 2 M.P. BABU
AGED 59 YEARS
SON OF PRABHAKARAN,
'CHAITHRAM',
VALLICODE PO,
PATHANAMTHITTA, PIN - 689642
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-30-

DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011

4 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673
BY ADV N.RAGUHURAJ
BY ADV P.VANDANA

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-31-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 31769 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 SHARMILA P.M.
AGED 50 YEARS
WIFE OF BABU K,
'KAYANEDATH', MUTHAMBI,
NADERI PO, ARIKKULAM,
KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673020
- 2 BABU K
AGED 56 YEARS
SON OF UNNARAKKUTTY,
'KAYANEDATH', MUTHAMBI,
NADERI PO, ARIKKULAM,
KOZHIKODE., PIN - 673020
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-32-

DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011

4 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673

ADV.N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-33-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 32268 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 GIGI VARGHESE
AGED 52 YEARS
WIFE OF JAMES GEORGE,
VALLAPURACKAL KANYAKONIL', PACHA,
CHEKKIDIKKADU PO, EDATHUA,
ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 689573
- 2 JAMES GEORGE
AGED 52 YEARS
SON OF A O GEORGE,
'EDATHIPARAMPIL HOUSE', PARUMALA PO,
THIRUVALLA, KADAPRA, PATHANAMTHITTA, PIN -
689626
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI
NEETHU S.

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 THE UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-34-

("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011

4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD
REPRESENTED BY THE MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673

ADV.N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-35-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 32275 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 DR. SUNITHA MONI
AGED 56 YEARS
WIFE OF ASOK LAL G,
TC 4/1397, YGRA 2,
KURAVANKONAM, KOWDIAR PO,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695003
- 2 ASOK LAL G
AGED 57 YEARS
SON OF P GANESAN,
TC 4/1397, YGRA 2,
KURAVANKONAM, KOWDIAR PO,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695003
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI
NEETHU S.

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 THE UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-36-

("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA , PIN - 682011

4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD
REPRESENTED BY THE MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
ADV.N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-37-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 32329 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 SABIRA
AGED 49 YEARS
WIFE OF MAMMAD KOYA,
'ERAVATTUKANDY', KAKKANCHERI,
ULLIYERI, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673620
- 2 MAMMAD KOYA
AGED 57 YEARS
SON OF IMPICHIMOITHY,
'ERAVATTUKANDY', KAKKANCHERI,
ULLIYERI, KOZHIKODE , PIN - 673620
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI
NEETHU S.

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI , PIN - 110001
- 2 THE STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-38-

PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD
REPRESENTED BY THE MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
ADV.N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-39-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 33128 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 RAJANI JAYAKRISHNAN
AGED 49 YEARS
WIFE OF JAYAKRISHNAN C N,
'VADAKKEKARA', ANANDAPURAM PO,
THRISSUR, PIN - 680305
- 2 JAYAKRISHNAN C.N.
AGED 60 YEARS
SON OF C KELU,
'VADAKKEKARA', ANANDAPURAM PO,
THRISSUR, PIN - 680305
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER,
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-40-

ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
4 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
BY ADV N.RAGHURAJ
BY ADV DEEPA RAJESH

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-41-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 33165 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 SREELAJA V
AGED 48 YEARS
WIFE OF C K PADMAGIREESAN,
SREENIVAS', MEPPAYIL PO,
VADAKARA, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673104
- 2 C.K.PADMAGIREESAN
AGED 56 YEARS
SON OF C KELU,
SREENIVAS', MEPPAYIL PO,
VADAKARA, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673104
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-42-

ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
4 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR
SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673

BY ADV SMT.M.SHAJNA, CGC
ADV.N.RAGURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY;

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-43-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 35095 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 M.K.SHERMILA
AGED 50 YEARS
WIFE OF ASOKAN K S,
'MADATHUM KANDIYIL HOUSE', NELLUNNI,
MATTANNUR PO, CHAVASSERY,
THALASSERY, KANNUR, PIN - 670702
- 2 ASOKAN K.S.
AGED 53 YEARS
SON OF KRISHNA PILLAI,
'SARADABHAVAN', NEAR CO-OPERATIVE SOCIETY,
CHIRAYINKEEZHU PO, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN -
695304
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI
NEETHU S.

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-44-

("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011

4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD
REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673

ADV.N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-45-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 35582 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 REMYA REMESH
AGED 40 YEARS
WIFE OF AJITH KUMAR V S,
'VETTARMADATHIL', KUDAYATHOOR,
IDUKKI, PIN - 685590
- 2 AJITH KUMAR V S
AGED 59 YEARS
SON OF SANKARA PILLA,
'VETTARMADATHIL', KUDAYATHOOR,
IDUKKI, PIN - 685590
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI
DEVIKA JAYARAJ

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH")
OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-46-

PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-47-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 35841 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 A.R SHYJA
AGED 55 YEARS
WIFE OF DR, HARIHARAN,
'KURUVAM CHIRA', KURUPPAMKULANGARA,
CHERTHALA NORTH, ALAPPUZHA - 688 539
- 2 DR. HARIHARAN
AGED 67 YEARS
SON OF NARAYANAN,
'KURUVAM CHIRA', KURUPPAMKULANGARA,
CHERTHALA NORTH, ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 688539
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
DEVIKA JAYARAJ
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-48-

DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011

4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT.LTD.
REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673

N.RAGHRAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-49-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 35900 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 INDIRA G
 AGED 49 YEARS
 DAUGHTER OF GOVINDAN V S,
 880, 'MAMPARAMBIL', A N PURAM,
 THIRUVAMPADY PO, ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 688002
- 2 CHANDRAN K.N.
 AGED 60 YEARS
 SON OF NARAYANAN,
 'KAROORPARAMBIL', KODAR LANE,
 ARAKULAM WEST, KODUNGALLOOR PO,
 THRISSUR, PIN - 680664

 BY ADVS.
 AKASH S.
 GIRISH KUMAR M S
 V.S.VARALEKSHMI
 DEVIKA JAYARAJ

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
 , REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
 MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
 SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
 REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
 MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
 SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
 ("RCH") OFFICER
 DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-50-

PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,
ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673
ADV.N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-51-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 35922 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 REMA P
AGED 50 YEARS
WIFE OF SIVADASAN P V, 'THIRUVATHIRA',
PUNTHALA PO, VENMONY, ALAPPUZHA - 689 509, PIN
- 689509
- 2 SIVADASAN P.V
AGED 61 YEARS
SON OF K VASU, 'THIRUVATHIRA',
PUNTHALA PO, VENMONY, ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 689509
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI
DEVIKA JAYARAJ

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-52-

ERNAKULAM, KERALA , PIN - 682011
4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673
BY ADV SHAIJU K.S., CGC

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; N.RAGHURAJ

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-53-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 36347 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 JOMON C.V.
AGED 52 YEARS
S/O C.I. VARGHESE, CHAKRAMAKKIL HOUSE, PALUVAI
P.O., THRISSUR , PIN - 680522
- 2 SUNI JOMON
AGED 50 YEARS
W/O JOMON C.V., CHAKRAMAKKIL HOUSE, PALUVAI
P.O., THRISSUR, PIN - 680522
BY ADVS.
ALEX.M.SCARIA
BEAS K. PONNAPPAN
A.J.RIYAS
SARITHA THOMAS
ALEN J. CHERUVIL
SAHL ABDUL KADER
SANJITH KUMAR R.

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 THE UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF
HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW
DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 THE STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF
HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM , PIN - 695001
- 3 THE APPROPRIATE AUTHORITY FORMED U/S 12 OF THE
ART (R) ACT, 2021
REPRESENTED BY VICE CHAIRPERSON - DR. PREETHI,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-54-

ADDITIONAL DIRECTOR OF HEALTH SERVICES (FW),
PALAYAM - AIRPORT ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL
ROAD JUNCTION, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, KERALA , PIN
- 695035

- 4 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH (RCH)
OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK
AVENUE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN -
682011
- 5 THE AMRITA INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCES
PONEKKARA P.O., KOCHI, REPRESENTED BY ITS
DIRECTOR, PIN - 682041
BY ADV SRI.SUVIN R.MENON, CGC

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; ADV.N.RAGHURAJ

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD
ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED
CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-55-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN

MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA,

1944

WP (C) NO. 37145 OF 2022

PETITIONER/S:

- 1 SUDHA
AGED 51 YEARS
WIFE OF KUNHIRAMAN,
'CHAVAYANGATT MEETHAL', KAVIL PO,
NADUVANNUR, KOZHIKODE , PIN - 673614
- 2 KUNHIRAMAN
AGED 58 YEARS
SON OF CHANGARAN,
'CHAVAYANGATT MEETHAL', KAVIL PO,
NADUVANNUR, KOZHIKODE , PIN - 673614
BY ADVS.
AKASH S.
GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI
DEVIKA JAYARAJ

RESPONDENT/S:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001
- 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH
("RCH") OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,
PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-56-

ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011
4 SABINE HOSPITAL & RESEARCH CENTRE PVT.LTD.
REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673

ADV.N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT:

AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP
RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR

**THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON
07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES,
THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:**

JUDGMENT

Dated this the 19th day of December, 2022

[WP (C) Nos.24058/2022, 24508/2022, 25078/2022, 26011/2022, 26035/2022, 26066/2022, 26559/2022, 26563/2022, 27099/2022, 27188/2022, 27212/2022, 27216/2022, 29282/2022, 29646/2022, 30545/2022, 31769/2022, 32268/2022, 32275/2022, 32329/2022, 33128/2022, 33165/2022, 35095/2022, 35582/2022, 35841/2022, 35900/2022, 35922/2022, 36347/2022, 37145/2022]

The writ petitions are filed by couples undergoing or intending to undergo assisted reproductive services, driven by the desire to have children. The petitioners challenge the upper age limit of 50 years for women and 55 years for men prescribed under the Assisted Reproductive Technology (Regulation) Act, 2021 ('the ART Act' for short), which prohibits the application of ART services to persons above the

prescribed age limit. According to the petitioners, prescription of the upper age limit under Section 21 (g) of the ART Act is irrational, arbitrary, unreasonable and violative of their right to reproduction, acknowledged as a fundamental right. They therefore want Section 21(g) of the ART Act, to the extent it prescribes an upper age limit for availing assisted reproductive technology services, to be declared unconstitutional.

2. Heard Advs.Akash Sathyanandan and Alex Scaria for the petitioners, S.Manu, the Deputy Solicitor General assisted by V. Girish Kumar, for the Central Government, Government Pleader Riyal Devassy for the State Government, N.Raguraj for the Kerala State Medical Council and Ramola Nayanpally, the *amicus curiae*.

3. Learned Counsel for the petitioners contended that there is no rationale in prescribing an upper age limit of 55 for men and

50 for women. It is submitted that, prior to the introduction of the ART Act, the 'National Guidelines for Accreditation, Supervision and Regulation of ART Clinics in India' ('the National Guidelines' for short), prepared by the Indian Council for Medical research ("ICMR") and National Academy of Medical Sciences (NAMS) was in force. Chapter 3 of the National Guidelines dealt with the 'Code of Practice, Ethical Considerations and Legal Issues". Therein, under the head 'General Considerations' the prescription was only with respect to the minimum age for ART. As no upper age limit was prescribed in the guidelines, the petitioners had opted for ART services, without being unduly worried about their age. Some of the petitioners were in the midst of their treatment when the ART Act came into effect on 25.01.2022, bringing the treatment came to a sudden halt. This has put the petitioners under extreme emotional stress and

some are in the verge of mental breakdown.

4. It is pointed out that, while the Surrogacy (Regulation) Act introduced with a similar objective contains a transitional provision, the ART Act contains no such provision. It is contended that the rights of individuals to found a family is recognised as a human right by the United Nations and reproductive rights has been recognised as an aspect of personal liberty under Article 21 of the Constitution of India by the Honourable Supreme Court also. In support of this contention reliance is placed on the decisions in *Suchita Srivastava and Anr. v. Chandigarh Administration* [(2009) 9 SCC 1], *K.S. Puttuswamy and another v Union of India* [(2017) 10 SCC 1]

5. Responding with alacrity to this Court's request for assistance, learned *amicus curiae* has submitted a detailed report after exhaustive

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-61-

reference to statutes, judgments, parliamentary debates, journal articles and interviews with doctors practicing infertility and reproductive medicine. According to the *amicus curiae*, the issue of limiting access to assisted reproductive techniques ought to be addressed from the psychological, ethical and social perspectives. From the psychological point of view, being restricted from accessing ART may lead to increased frustration of families who are unable to reproduce naturally. Ethically, objections may arise by measuring the value of life of the newborn against the risks associated with the mothers' advanced age. On the social perspective, it is to be noticed that, with the increased use of ART, administration of such technologies has gained a social value with demographic relevancy. Certain studies have shown that later parenthood is associated with a more stable family environment, a higher socio-economic position,

higher income and better living conditions as well as better parenting practices. However, concerns regarding the reduced physical capacity to meet the demands of parenthood, fear of premature parental loss, social stigma and absence of grandparents are projected as reasons for preferring parents of younger age. In addition to the above mentioned aspects, wider considerations such as higher success rates with repeated treatment cycles and role of the State in regulating reproduction also assumes relevance.

6. Referring to Clause 3.1.6 in the 129th report of the Department Related Parliament Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare, it is pointed out that a Senior Consultant & Professor of AIIMS and a representative from the Department of Reproductive Medicine, Christian Medical College & Hospital, Vellore had submitted that the lower age limit for woman seeking ART

services should be more than 20 years and the upper age limit for both men and women should be decided based on factors like risk to maternal health due to pregnancy at advanced maternal age; care of child until 18 years and average life expectancy in India. It is submitted that except noting such suggestions, there was no discussion on the aspects by the experts. To highlight the impracticality in fixing the upper age limit, it is pointed out that, by reason of the upper age limit, a married woman below 50 years will not be permitted to undergo assisted reproductive services if her husband has crossed 55 years of age, while an unmarried woman can avail such service till she attains 50 years.

7. Learned *amicus curiae* suggested that, since the National Assisted Reproductive Technology and Surrogacy Board (National Board, constituted in terms of Section 15(1) of the Surrogacy (Regulation) Act is empowered to review

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-64-

and monitor the implementation of the ART Act and recommend suitable changes, it will be apposite to direct the National Board to review the upper age limit and make necessary recommendations to the Central Government.

8. On behalf of the Central Government, it is submitted that the Department-Related Parliament Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare had considered all relevant aspects before prescribing the upper age limit. After due deliberation, based on inputs received from various stakeholders, the Committee recommended the age criteria of 21 to 50 years for women and 21 to 55 years for men to be the most suitable. The report of the Committee was placed before both the houses of Parliament and passed after due discussion. There is no irrationality in prescribing the upper age limit and no scope for interference with the provisions of a well thought out and well intended legislation.

9. Before proceeding to decide the constitutionality of Section 21(g), it is essential to have an idea about the conception, evolution and introduction of the ART Act. For this purpose, it is necessary to note that the benefits of assisted reproductive techniques came into focus with the birth of Louise Brown, the world's first test tube baby, on 25th July, 1978. About two months later, the world's second and India's first IVF baby, Kanupriya @ Durga was born in Kolkata. Since then, the field of assisted reproductive technology has grown exponentially and India has become one of the major centres for ART services. This gave rise to a multitude of legal, ethical and social issues, in the absence of any prescribed standards or protocols. The Central Government was therefore prompted to call upon the ICMR to draft the National Guidelines for Accreditation, Supervision and Regulation of ART Clinics in

India. Later, the Law Commission of India presented its 228th report, recommending active legislative intervention to facilitate the correct use of ART technology and legalisation of surrogacy. Accordingly, the Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare submitted the 102nd report on the Surrogacy Regulation Bill. The Committee observed that along with Surrogacy Regulation, there is an urgent need to regulate ART Clinics across the country. Consequently, the ART (Regulation) Bill was introduced in the Lok Sabha on 14.09.2020 and referred to the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare. The Standing Committee sought the views of stakeholders and Governments and presented the 129th report on the ART (Regulation) Bill, 2020 before the Parliament on 19.03.2021. The Bill was passed on 01.12.2021 and the Act came into force on 25.01.2022.

10. The objective of the ART Act, as discernible from its preamble, is to regulate and supervise the assisted reproductive technology clinics and banks to prevent misuse and ensure safe and ethical practice of Assisted Reproductive Technology Service etc. As per Section 2(1)(a) of the Act, "assisted reproductive technology", with its grammatical variations and cognate expressions, means all techniques that attempt to obtain a pregnancy by handling the sperm or the oocyte outside the human body and transferring the gamete or the embryo into the reproductive system of a woman." Section 2(1)(e) defines "commissioning couple" as an infertile married couple who approach an assisted reproductive technology clinic or assisted reproductive technology bank for obtaining the authorised services of that clinic or bank. Section 2(1)(j) defines "infertility" as the inability to conceive after one year of

unprotected coitus or other proven medical condition preventing a couple from conception. Section 2(1)(u) defines a "woman" to mean any woman above the age of twenty-one years who approaches an assisted reproductive technology clinic or assisted reproductive technology bank for obtaining the authorised services of the clinic or bank. Section 21 of the Act requires the ART clinics and banks to perform certain enumerated duties. As per Section 21(g), the clinics shall apply the assisted reproductive technology services, (i) to a woman above the age of twenty-one years and below the age of fifty years and (ii) to a man above the age of twenty-one years and below the age of fifty-five years.

11. Having carefully perused the report of the Parliamentary Committee, I find merit in the contention that the prescription of upper age limit is made without much discussion. In the 129th report of the Parliamentary Committee,

except referring to the suggestion put forth by the experts regarding the need for prescribing the upper age limit for women/men, there is no discussion on the relevant aspects. The Parliamentary debates on the Assisted Reproductive Technology (Regulation) Bill, 2020 also does not reveal any discussion on the age factor of the commissioning couple. Be that as it may, absence of deliberation by the legislature is not sufficient to hold a statutory provision to be unconstitutional. There could have been discussion regarding the absence of international conventions or treaties regulating ART. Another factor of relevance is that in most of the countries providing ART services, the practice is regulated by domestic legislation, guidelines or both. Countries like Estonia, Greece and Netherlands has set the mother's age limit at 50 years, the Czech Republic at 49 years, Belgium, Bulgeria, Denmark and Ireland at 45 years. At the

same time, countries like France, Germany, Portugal, Spain, Sweden and UK do not have a specified age limit, but prescribes that the maximum age limit of the mother shall be within the natural reproductive age of a woman. Particularly, the father's age limit is not considered as a factor except in France and Sweden. It is also worthwhile to note that while some studies find advanced paternal age to be having a negative impact on ART outcome, others are of opinion that it has no impact at all. In most cases, it is advised to do pre-implantation genetic testing for embryos creating using older father's sperm or aneuploidy screening of sperm cells taken from men of advanced age. As the ART Act mandates pre-implantation genetic testing for embryos, a significant part of the apprehensions pertaining to sperm health of older men stands allayed. These are some of the relevant aspects which could have been taken into consideration

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-71-

while fixing the upper age limit for availing ART services.

12. On the contention that the State cannot regulate the reproductive choices of its citizens, it may be worthwhile to refer to Article 16(1) of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, extracted hereunder;

"Article 16(1) Men and women of full age, without any limitation due to race, nationality or religion, have the right to marry and to found a family. They are entitled to equal rights as to marriage, during marriage and at its dissolution."

In **Suchita Srivastava** (supra), the Apex Court held reproductive choice of women to be a dimension of her personal liberty. The contextually relevant portion of the judgment reads as under;

"22. There is no doubt that a woman's right to make reproductive choices is also a dimension of "personal liberty" as

understood under Article 21 of the Constitution of India. It is important to recognise that reproductive choices can be exercised to procreate as well as to abstain from procreating. The crucial consideration is that a woman's right to privacy, dignity and bodily integrity should be respected. This means that there should be no restriction whatsoever on the exercise of reproductive choices such as a woman's right to refuse participation in sexual activity or alternatively the insistence on use of contraceptive methods. Furthermore, women are also free to choose birth control methods such as undergoing sterilisation procedures. Taken to their logical conclusion, reproductive rights include a woman's entitlement to carry a pregnancy to its full term, to give birth and to subsequently raise children. However, in the case of pregnant women there is also a "compelling State interest" in protecting the life of the prospective child. Therefore, the termination of a pregnancy is only permitted when the conditions specified in the applicable statute have been fulfilled. Hence, the provisions of the MTP Act, 1971 can also be viewed as reasonable restrictions that have been placed on the exercise of reproductive choices."

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-73-

Later in **K.S. Puttuswamy** (*supra*), the Constitution Bench declared family, marriage, procreation and sexual orientation as integral to the dignity of an individual. Paragraph 298 of the judgment is extracted hereunder for easy reference;

"298. Privacy of the individual is an essential aspect of dignity. Dignity has both an intrinsic and instrumental value. As an intrinsic value, human dignity is an entitlement or a constitutionally protected interest in itself. In its instrumental facet, dignity and freedom are inseparably intertwined, each being a facilitative tool to achieve the other. The ability of the individual to protect a zone of privacy enables the realisation of the full value of life and liberty. Liberty has a broader meaning of which privacy is a subset. All liberties may not be exercised in privacy. Yet others can be fulfilled only within a private space. Privacy enables the individual to retain the autonomy of the body and mind. The autonomy of the individual is the ability to make decisions on vital matters of concern to life. Privacy has not been couched as an independent fundamental right. But that

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-74-

does not detract from the constitutional protection afforded to it, once the true nature of privacy and its relationship with those fundamental rights which are expressly protected is understood. Privacy lies across the spectrum of protected freedoms. The guarantee of equality is a guarantee against arbitrary State action. It prevents the State from discriminating between individuals. The destruction by the State of a sanctified personal space whether of the body or of the mind is violative of the guarantee against arbitrary State action. Privacy of the body entitles an individual to the integrity of the physical aspects of personhood. The intersection between one's mental integrity and privacy entitles the individual to freedom of thought, the freedom to believe in what is right, and the freedom of self-determination. When these guarantees intersect with gender, they create a private space which protects all those elements which are crucial to gender identity. **The family, marriage, procreation and sexual orientation are all integral to the dignity of the individual. Above all, the privacy of the individual recognises an inviolable right to determine how freedom shall be exercised.** An individual may

*perceive that the best form of expression is to remain silent. Silence postulates a realm of privacy. An artist finds reflection of the soul in a creative endeavour. A writer expresses the outcome of a process of thought. A musician contemplates upon notes which musically lead to silence. The silence, which lies within, reflects on the ability to choose how to convey thoughts and ideas or interact with others. These are crucial aspects of personhood. The freedoms under Article 19 can be fulfilled where the individual is entitled to decide upon his or her preferences. **Read in conjunction with Article 21, liberty enables the individual to have a choice of preferences on various facets of life including what and how one will eat, the way one will dress, the faith one will espouse and a myriad other matters on which autonomy and self-determination require a choice to be made within the privacy of the mind.** The constitutional right to the freedom of religion under Article 25 has implicit within it the ability to choose a faith and the freedom to express or not express those choices to the world. These are some illustrations of the manner in which*

privacy facilitates freedom and is intrinsic to the exercise of liberty. The Constitution does not contain a separate article telling us that privacy has been declared to be a fundamental right. Nor have we tagged the provisions of Part III with an alpha-suffixed right to privacy: this is not an act of judicial redrafting. Dignity cannot exist without privacy. Both reside within the inalienable values of life, liberty and freedom which the Constitution has recognised. Privacy is the ultimate expression of the sanctity of the individual. It is a constitutional value which straddles across the spectrum of fundamental rights and protects for the individual a zone of choice and self-determination.”

(emphasis supplied)

13. Thus, the personal choice of individuals to procreate and build family is held to be a facet of his/her fundamental right. This right is being restricted by fixing an upper age limit for availing ART services. While the State has the power to impose reasonable restrictions, such restriction can always be tested on the

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-77-

touchstone of liberty guaranteed under Article 21. It is now settled that legislative action can be challenged on the ground of lack of legislative competence, violation of fundamental rights or any other constitutional provision and manifest arbitrariness. In ***Shayara Bano v. Union of India*** [(2017) 9 SCC 1], the Apex Court has termed 'manifest arbitrariness' as something done by the legislature capriciously, irrationally and/or without adequate determining principle. Also, when something is done which is excessive and disproportionate, such legislation would be manifestly arbitrary. At the same time, this Court has to be mindful of the principle of 'presumption of constitutionality of legislations'. On a careful balancing of the above principles, I find it difficult to hold the prescription of upper age limit in Section 21(g) to be so excessive and arbitrary as to warrant judicial interference. At the same time, I find

the imposition of age restriction, without even a transitional provision, to be irrational and arbitrary. As mentioned earlier, some of the petitioners were undergoing assisted reproductive technology services when the ART Act was introduced on 25.01.2022. The prohibition under Section 21(g), if understood to be preventing even continuance of ART services already commenced, would definitely amount to unreasonable and unjustified restriction on the reproductive choice of the commissioning couple and would militate against the liberty guaranteed under Article 21.

14. As rightly pointed out by the *amicus curiae*, Section 5 of the Act confers the National Assisted Reproductive Technology and Surrogacy Board with the power to advice the Central Government on policy matters relating to assisted reproductive technology. In my opinion, the impact of the prescription of upper age limit

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-79-

on the liberty of individuals is a matter which the National Board should bring to the notice of the Central Government, so as to effectuate a detailed discussion on the subject and pave the way for necessary amendments.

Based on the above discussion, the following directions are issued;

(i) Those among the petitioners who were undergoing ART services as on 25.01.2022 shall be permitted to continue their treatment.

(ii) The National Board shall alert the Central Government about the need for having a re-look at the upper age limit prescribed in Section 21(g) of the Act.

(iii) The National Board shall also bring to the notice of the Central Government the requirement of including a transitional provision in the ART Act.

(iv) The above directions shall be complied by the National Board within three months of

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-80-

receipt of a copy of this judgment.

(v) Those among the petitioners who are yet to commence their ART treatment shall await the decision of the Central Government on the upper age limit and the transitional provision.

(vi) The liberty of the petitioners to approach this Court at a later stage, if so necessitated, is reserved.

I place on record my appreciation for the immense help rendered by the learned *amicus curiae*.

Sd/-

V.G.ARUN
JUDGE

Scl/

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-81-

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 24058/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE
1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE
2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER OF THE
INSPECTOR GENERAL, STS BSF, BANGALORE
NUMBERED AS EXT/STS/BSF/VOL RET
VP/2021/21088-97 DATED 10.11.2021,
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND
OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT AND OTHER
HOSPITAL RECORDS OF THE PETITIONERS
OBTAINED FROM THE 7TH RESPONDENT
HOSPITAL DATED 29.11.2021
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT EXTRACT OF
THE NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR
ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA'
("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY
THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL
RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

RESPONDENT EXHIBITS

- Exhibit R1(a) Relevant extract of Report no. 129 of
Rajya Sabha

APPENDIX OF WP (C) 24508/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE
1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE
2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE
PASSPORT OF THE 2ND PETITIONER, THAT
WOULD SHOW HIS VISA STAMPING AND THE
LAST ENTRY IN INDIA,
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND
OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT AND OTHER
HOSPITAL RECORDS DATED 13.09.2021 AND
MEDICAL RECORDS DATED 23.09.2021 OF
THE PETITIONERS, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH
RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT EXTRACT OF
THE OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR
ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA'
("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY
THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL
RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 25078/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3(a) TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT DATED 17.06.2019 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
- Exhibit P3(b) TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT DATED 17.06.2019 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
- Exhibit P3(c) TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT DATED 21.12.2019 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
- Exhibit P3(d) TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT DATED 21.12.2019 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT AND LABORATORY REPORT DATED 05.09.2020
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY FROM ASTER MEDICITY KOCHI, ERNAKULAM DATED 30.08.2022

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 26011/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE OPERATION NOTES OF THE HYSTEROSCOPIC AND LAPAROSCOPIC MYOMECTOMY TREATMENT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 02.10.2013
- Exhibit P3(a) TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 03.10.2013 ISSUED BY RAJI NURSING HOME, CHEMBUKKAVU, THRISSUR
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE HYSTEROSCOPY AND LAPAROSCOPIC MYOMECTOMY CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 24.05.2016
- Exhibit P4(a) TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 28.05.2016 ISSUED BY THE CRAFT HOSPITAL & RESEARCH CENTRE, KODUNGALLUR, THRISSUR
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY CIMAR FERTILITY CENTRE, CHERANALLORE, EDAPALLY (VIA), KOCHI,
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-85-

APPENDIX OF WP (C) 26035/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE
1ST PETITIONER

Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE
2ND PETITIONER

Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE DETAILS OF THE
TREATMENT AT PUTHENPURACKAL AYURVEDA
PHARMACY, EDAMATTOM FROM 22.10.2018 TO
28.11.2019

Exhibit P4 (a) TRUE COPY OF THE OBSTETRICS USG SCAN
REPORT DATED 30.06.2022 AT THE 6TH
RESPONDENT HOSPITAL

Exhibit P4 (b) TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT
DATED 30.06.2022 AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT
HOSPITAL

Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE
'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR
ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA'
("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY
THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL
RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-86-

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 26066/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE
1ST PETITIONER

Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE
2ND PETITIONER

Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND
OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT AND THE
LABORATORY REPORT DATED 12.09.2019 OF
THE 1ST PETITIONER, OBTAINED FROM THE
6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL

Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE
'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR
ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA'
("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY
THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL
RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP (C) 26559/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND PELVIC SCAN REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 16.08.2017
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE SEMEN ANALYSIS REPORT OF THE 2ND PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 16.08.2017
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE ISCHARGE SUMMARY FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 19.09.2017
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE REAL TIME B-MODE TAS - 3D/TVS/DOPPLER, ULTRASONOGRAPHY REPORT ISSUED BY THE MEDISERV DIAGNOSTICS, CALICUT DATED 18.04.2019
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRASOUND FOLLICULAR STUDY CONDUCTED AT CLEAR SCAN & DIAGNOSTIC CENTRE, KOTTAPARAMBA, KOZHIKODE - 1 DATED 09.11.2020
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 29.10.2021 OF THE PETITIONERS
- Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 18.02.2022 AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
- Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE OBSTETRICS ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 19.02.2022 AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
- Exhibit P11 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-88-

RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 26563/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1	TRUE COPY OF TEHE AADHAR CARD OF TEH 1ST PETITIONER
Exhibit P2	TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF TEH 2ND PETITIONER
Exhibit P3	TRUE COPY OF TEH DISCHARGE SUMMARY FROM LAKSHMI HOSPITAL DATED 30.08.2012 IN RESPECT OF THE PETITIONERS
Exhibit P4	TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY FROM INDIRA GANDHI CO-OPERATIVE HOSPITAL DATED 25.11.2013 IN RESPECT OF TEH PETITIONERS
Exhibit P5	TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 12.05.2014
Exhibit P6	TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 23.02.2015
Exhibit P7	TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 01.10.2015
Exhibit P8	TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 16.10.2018
Exhibit P9	TRUE COPY OF THE OBSTETRICS USG SCAN REPORT DATED 25.05.2022 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
Exhibit P10	TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT DATED 25.05.2022 OF TEH 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
Exhibit P11	TRUE COPY OF TEH RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 27099/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE CERTIFICATE OF MARRIAGE DATED 15.06.2019 OF THE PETITIONERS
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN OF ABDOMEN AND PELVIS CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY DR. SHAJI'S MRI AND MEDICAL RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD., AT THE REFERENCE OF THE HOMOEOPATHIC DOCTOR DATED 22.04.2021
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT DATED 13.08.2022 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE KOKOORI LAPAROSCOPIC AND IVF CLINIC
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE CYTOLOGY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY CPC MEDICAL LABORATORY
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER OF THE DISTRICT CHIEF OF POLICE, KOZHIKODE CITY ISSUED ON 24.05.2022, AT THE RELIEVING THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 27188/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF THE ART TREATMENT CONDUCTED ON THE PETITIONERS AT CIMAR FERTILITY CENTRE DATED 13.11.2018
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF EMBRYO TRANSFER DONE ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT THE CIMAR FERTILITY CENTRE, DATED 04.06.2019
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT THE CIMAR FERTILITY CENTRE, DATED 18.06.2019
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE MITERA HOSPITAL DATED 25.09.2019
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE MITERA HOSPITAL DATED 21.10.2019
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE MITERA HOSPITAL DATED 24.10.2019
- Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 27212/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE
1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF
THE2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE USG REPORT OF THE 1ST
PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE WOMEN AND
CHILDREN HOSPITAL, THYCAUD DATED
10.08.2017
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL EXAMINATION
REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY
THE WOMEN AND CHILDREN HOSPITAL,
THYCAUD DATED 23.08.2017
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE
'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR
ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA'
("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY
THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL
RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-93-

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 27216/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE
1ST PETITIONER

Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AAHAAR CARD OF THE
2ND PETITIONER

Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE CERTIFICATE OF
MARRIAGE DATED 03.01.2021 BETWEEN THE
PETITIONERS

Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN OF
PELVIS CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST
PETITIONER, AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT
HOSPITAL, DATED 31.08.2021

Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE FOLLICULAR MONITORING
REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY
THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL

Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE
'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR
ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA'
("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY
THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL
RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

RESPONDENT EXHIBITS

Exhibit R1(A) TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT EXTRACT OF
REPORT NO. 129 OF THE RAJYA SABHA

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 29282/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED BY A COUNSULTANT RADIOLOGIST AND SONOLOGIST, DR. MILIND S GUNE, DATED 13.06.2003
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY FROM THE MEDICAL COLLEGE HOSPITAL, THRISSUR, DATED 27.05.2005
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE LAB TEST RESULT AT CRAFT HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE DATED 29.11.2007
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY ISSUED BY THE BENZER NURSING HOME, ANDHERI, MUMBAI DATED 24.01.2010
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE POLYCLINIC PRIVATE LIMITED, DATED 25.03.2011
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE ORIGIN INTERNATIONAL FERTILITY CENTRE, THANE, MAHARASHTRA, DATED 19.10.2012
- Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ORIGIN INTERNATIONAL FERTILITY CENTRE, THANE, MAHARASHTRA, DATED 28.11.2012
- Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE IVF/ICSI SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ORIGIN INTERNATIONAL FERTILITY CENTRE, THANE, MAHARASHTRA, DATED 10.01.2013
- Exhibit P11 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ORIGIN INTERNATIONAL FERTILITY CENTRE, THANE, MAHARASHTRA, DATED 15.01.2013

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-95-

- Exhibit P12 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT AMBERNATH DIAGNOSTIC CENTRE, AMBERNATH, MAHARASHTRA, DATED 04.07.2014
- Exhibit P13 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT THE BISHOP ALAPATT MISSION HOSPITAL, KRANCHIRA, KATTOOR, DATED 17.03.2016,
- Exhibit P14 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT THE BISHOP ALAPATT MISSION HOSPITAL, KRANCHIRA, KATTOOR, DATED 17.10.2016
- Exhibit P15 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE UPPER ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT THE BISHOP ALAPATT MISSION HOSPITAL, KRANCHIRA, KATTOOR, DATED 16.11.2017
- Exhibit P16 TRUE COPY OF THE ICSI PROTOCOL SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE KARE CENTRE: INFERTILITY TREATMENT CENTRE, THRISSUR, DATED 26.07.2018
- Exhibit P17 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 29646/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 2ND PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE DAYA GENERAL HOSPITAL AND SPECIALTY SURGICAL CENTRE, THRISSUR DATED 02.12.2001
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER CONDUCTED AT THE SANTHI NURSING HOME, PUNNAYURKULAM, THRISSUR
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL RECORDS OF THE 2ND PETITIONER DATED 27.05.2020, ISSUED BY THE INFERTILITY TREATMENT CENTRE, DISTRICT HOMOEOPATHIC HOSPITAL, THRISSUR
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 2ND PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT JEEVA SPECIALITY LABORATORY, THRISSUR, AT THE DIRECTION OF THE HOMOEOPATHIC PRACTITIONER OF THE JANANI PROGRAM, DATED 01.06.2020
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE ABDOMEN OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT JEEVA SPECIALITY LABORATORY, THRISSUR DATED 01.06.2020
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL RECORDS OF THE 2ND PETITIONER DATED 28.10.2020, ISSUED BY THE INFERTILITY TREATMENT CENTRE, DISTRICT HOMOEOPATHIC HOSPITAL, THRISSUR
- Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL RECORDS OF THE 2ND PETITIONER DATED 23.12.2020, ISSUED BY THE INFERTILITY TREATMENT CENTRE, DISTRICT HOMOEOPATHIC

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-97-

Exhibit P10	HOSPITAL, THRISSUR TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL RECORDS OF THE 2ND PETITIONER DATED 17.02.2021, ISSUED BY THE INFERTILITY TREATMENT CENTRE, DISTRICT HOMOEOPATHIC HOSPITAL, THRISSUR,
Exhibit P11	TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT JEEVA SPECIALITY LABORATORY, THRISSUR, AT THE DIRECTION OF THE HOMOEOPATHIC PRACTITIONER OF THE JANANI PROGRAM, DATED 15.03.2021
Exhibit P12	TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005
Exhibit R1(a)	True copy of relevant extract of Report No. 129 presented to Rajya Sabha on 19.03.2021

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 30545/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE LIFELINE SUPER SPECIALTY HOSPITAL, ADOOR, PATHANAMTHITTA DATED 24.12.2011
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE USG SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 05.09.2019, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL,
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF THE IVF PROCEDURE CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 27.12.2019
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGE OF THE 2ND PETITIONER'S PASSPORT SHOWING THE IMMIGRATION STAMP DATED 21.09.2021
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGE OF THE 2ND PETITIONER'S PASSPORT SHOWING THE IMMIGRATION STAMP DATED 29.08.2022
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE USG SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 15.09.2022, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
- Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 31769/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE NATIONAL HOSPITAL, KOZHIKODE DATED 18.04.2007
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE NATIONAL HOSPITAL, KOZHIKODE DATED 30.07.2008
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE DIAGNOSTIC REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE PREMIER DIAGNOSTICS AND RESEARCH CENTRE, KOZHIKODE, DATED 01.08.2008
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ASIAN REPRODUCTIVE MEDICINE CENTRE, PUTHIYARA, KOZHIKODE, DATED 11.12.2011
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE TRANSVAGINAL SONOGRAPHY REPORT DATED 24.12.2012 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY RAJENDRA NURSING HOME, CALICUT
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT DATED 19.06.2015 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY VINDHYA CLINICAL LAB, CALICUT
- Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT DATED 11.09.2017 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY ORBITO ASIA LABS AND SCANS, CALICUT
- Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION DATED 21.02.2018 ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER, BY DOCTOR AT ARC INTERNATIONAL FERTILITY AND RESEARCH CENTRE, CHENNAI
- Exhibit P11 TRUE COPY OF THE SALINE SONO HYSTEROGRAPHY REPORT DATED 10.03.2018

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-100-

- OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY BABY MEMORIAL HOSPITAL LTD, KOZHIKODE
- Exhibit P12 TRUE COPY OF THE THE FERTILITY HORMONAL ASSAY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE NAHA'S CENTRE FOR ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ENDOSCOPY, NAHAS HOSPITAL, MALAPPURAM, AND DATED 26.03.2019
- Exhibit P13 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CARRIED OUT ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE NAHA'S CENTRE FOR ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ENDOSCOPY, NAHAS HOSPITAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED 12.03.2019
- Exhibit P14 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CARRIED OUT ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE NAHA'S CENTRE FOR ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ENDOSCOPY, NAHAS HOSPITAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED 30.06.2020
- Exhibit P15 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CARRIED OUT ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE NAHA'S CENTRE FOR ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ENDOSCOPY, NAHAS HOSPITAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED 22.07.2021
- Exhibit P16 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CARRIED OUT ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE NAHA'S CENTRE FOR ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ENDOSCOPY, NAHAS HOSPITAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED 09.10.2021
- Exhibit P17 TRUE COPY OF THE USG SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 28.01.2022, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
- Exhibit P18 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-101-

OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-102-

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32268/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE
1ST PETITIONER

Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE
2ND PETITIONER

Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE PRESCRIPTION ISSUED
TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE DOCTOR AT
DR. LEELAMMA CLINIC IN DOHA, QATAR

Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE PELVIC SCAN REPORT OF
THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE
SAMAD IVF HOSPITAL, PATTOOR,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, ON 18.09.2018

Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF
PROCEDURE CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST
PETITIONER AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT
HOSPITAL, DATED 25.12.2019

Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE FINAL REPORT OF THE
PROCEDURES CONDUCTED ON 1ST PETITIONER
AT THE WOMEN'S WELLNESS AND RESEARCH
CENTER, QATAR, DATED 05.01.2020

Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE
'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR
ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA'
("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY
THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL
RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-103-

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32275/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1	TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
Exhibit P2	TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
Exhibit P3	TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32329/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER.
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE FOLLICULAR ULTRASOUND STUDY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE AUREOLA MEDICAL CENTRE, MAVOOR ROAD, KOZHIKODE DATED 21.11.1997
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE FOLLICULAR ULTRASOUND STUDY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE AUREOLA MEDICAL CENTRE, MAVOOR ROAD, KOZHIKODE DATED 18.12.1997
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE FOLLICULAR ULTRASOUND STUDY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE AUREOLA MEDICAL CENTRE, MAVOOR ROAD, KOZHIKODE DATED 22.12.1997
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL RECORDS INDICATING THAT THE 1ST PETITIONER UNDERWENT LAPAROSCOPY ON 07.08.2000
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT OF THE HORMONAL TEST CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE ENDOCRINE LABORATORY AND CLINIC, PONKUNNAM, THRISSUR, DATED 07.08.2000
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE USG SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 02.03.2020, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL
- Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE ADVICE TO THE 1ST PETITIONER TO UNDERGO HYSTEROSCOPIC POLYPECTOMY, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 03.03.2020
- Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA'

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-105-

("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY
THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL
RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 33128/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE MYOMETOMY CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE KARE HOSPITAL, DATED ON 11.06.2007
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF THE ICSI PROCEDURE CARRIED OUT ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE KARE HOSPITAL, THRISSUR, ON 17.04.2008
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL ADVICE TO THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE KARE HOSPITAL, THRISSUR, ON 17.04.2008
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 03.08.2021
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 23.11.2021
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 33165/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1	TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
Exhibit P2	TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
Exhibit P3	TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE HYSTEROSCOPY CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE CRAFT HOSPITAL, DATED ON 09.04.2004
Exhibit P4	TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE PELVISCOPY CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE CRAFT HOSPITAL, DATED ON 16.04.2004
Exhibit P5	TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE BABY MEMORIAL HOSPITAL, CALICUT, ON 02.12.2008
Exhibit P6	TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ASIAN REPRODUCTIVE MEDICINE CENTRE, KOZHIKODE, ON 10.03.2011
Exhibit P7	TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ASIAN REPRODUCTIVE MEDICINE CENTRE, KOZHIKODE, ON 19.09.2010
Exhibit P8	TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE HYSTEROSCOPY CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 14.03.2021
Exhibit P9	TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 16.10.2021
Exhibit P10	TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-108-

OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 35095/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE CERTIFICATE OF MARRIAGE OF THE PETITIONERS DATED 16.12.2016
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE DR. MOLLY M DAS MEMORIAL TRUST V V CLINIC, ATTINGAL, DATED ON 13.07.2017
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE PRESCRIPTION FOR CONDUCTING VARIOUS TESTS, ISSUED BY THE CONSULTANT GYNECOLOGIST AT TALUK HOSPITAL, CHIRAYINKEEZHU, DATED 08.03.2021
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE SONOGRAPHY CONDUCTED ON THE ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE METRO SCANS AND LABORATORY, ATTINGAL, DATED 10.02.2020
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT, BASED ON THE TESTS CONDUCTED ON THE 2ND PETITIONER, DATED 10.02.2020
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP (C) 35582/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF THE IVF PROCEDURE ISSUED BY THE CRAFT HOSPITAL, KODUNGALLUR, DATED 29.12.2011
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED ON 08.12.2015
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 20.12.2015
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE SEMEN ANALYSIS REPORT OF THE 2ND PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 11.03.2016
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE SCAN CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT MITERA HOSPITAL, KOTTAYAM, DATED 08.11.2021
- Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE BLOOD TEST CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT MITERA HOSPITAL, KOTTAYAM, DATED 02.12.2021
- Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-111-

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 35841/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE
1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE
2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF
THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE SAMAD
IVF HOSPITAL, PATTOOR,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, THAT ALSO
SUMMARIZES PREVIOUS TREATMENTS, DATED
ON 20.02.2016
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ADVICE FOR IVF
PROCEDURE AND THE RECEIPT OF PAYMENT,
ISSUED BY SAMAD IVF HOSPITAL, PATTOOR,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, DATED 01.10.2016
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE
ULTRASOUND SCAN CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST
PETITIONER, AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT
HOSPITAL, DATED 06.12.2021
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE BLOOD
TEST CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER,
AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED
06.12.2021
- Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE
'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR
ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA'
("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY
THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL
RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-112-

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 35900/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1	TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
Exhibit P2	TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
Exhibit P3	TRUE COPY OF THE CERTIFICATE OF MARRIAGE ISSUED BY THE VILANJOOR SREE BHAGAVATHI TEMPLE TRUST (PVT) DATED 06.07.2019
Exhibit P4	TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE DIAL SCANS, ALAPPUZHA, DATED ON 01.06.2020
Exhibit P5	TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

APPENDIX OF WP (C) 35922/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1	TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
Exhibit P2	TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
Exhibit P3	TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE SBM HOSPITAL, KARUNAGAPPALLY, DATED 28.08.2017
Exhibit P4	TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE AYURVEDIC PRACTITIONER, DATED 02.07.2018
Exhibit P5	TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE AYURVEDIC PRACTITIONER, DATED 29.07.2018
Exhibit P6	TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE AYURVEDIC PRACTITIONER, DATED 11.09.2018
Exhibit P7	TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE AYURVEDIC PRACTITIONER, DATED 12.11.2018
Exhibit P8	TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE AYURVEDIC PRACTITIONER, DATED 26.12.2018
Exhibit P9	TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE SCAN CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 07.06.2021
Exhibit P10	TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE SEMEN ANALYSIS TEST CONDUCTED ON THE 2ND PETITIONER, AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 07.06.2021
Exhibit1 P11	TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF THE IVF TREATMENT CONDUCTED AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 16.10.2021

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-114-

Exhibit1 P12

TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF
THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE 4TH
RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 04.12.2021

Exhibit P13

TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE
'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR
ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA'
("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY
THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL
RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY
OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF
OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-115-

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 36347/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE MARRIAGE CERTIFICATE DATED 08/11/2022 OF THE PETITIONERS.

Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE DEATH CERTIFICATE DATED 08/11/2022 OF THE PETITIONER'S DAUGHTER.

Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE VARIOUS LAB REPORTS AND TREATMENT BILL OF THE PETITIONERS.

Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ART TREATMENT SUMMARY DATED 22/09/2021 ISSUED BY AMRITA FERTILITY CENTER.

Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY DATED 02/11/2021 OF THE 2ND PETITIONER FROM THE GYNECOLOGY DEPARTMENT OF AMRITA INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCE & RESEARCH CENTER.

Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY DATED 15/11/2021 ISSUED TO THE 2ND PETITIONER FROM THE GYNECOLOGY DEPARTMENT OF AMRITA INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCE & RESEARCH CENTER.

Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE PELVIC SCAN REPORT DATED 21/01/2022 ISSUED TO THE 2ND PETITIONER FROM AMRITA INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCE & RESEARCH CENTER.

Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE NOTIFICATION DATED 20/01/2022 BEARING NO. S.O. 291(E) PASSED BY THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE.

Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE GAZETTE NOTIFICATION DATED 18/12/2021 OF THE ASSISTED REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGY (REGULATION) ACT, 2021.

Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE GAZETTE NOTIFICATION, BEARING NO. G.S.R. 419 (E) DATED 07/06/2022 PASSED BY THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE.

Exhibit P11 TRUE COPY OF THE NOTIFICATION DATED 20/06/2022 BEARING NO. G.O(P)NO.25/2022/H&FWDD.

W.P.(C) No.24058 of 2022 & con.cases

-116-

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 37145/2022

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

- Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
- Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
- Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ENDOCRINOLOGY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE CIMAR HOSPITAL, EDAPPAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED ON 13.07.2016
- Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ENDOCRINOLOGY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE CIMAR HOSPITAL, EDAPPAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED ON 19.11.2016,
- Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE ENDOCRINOLOGY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE CIMAR HOSPITAL, EDAPPAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED ON 21.11.2017
- Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005