\$~15.

## \* IN THE HIGH COURT OF DELHI AT NEW DELHI

+ W.P.(C) 2501/2019 & CM APPL. 11667/2019

# NATIONAL PLATFORM FOR THE RIGHTS OF THE DISABLED (NPRD0 THROUGH ITS GENERAL SECRETARY..... Petitioner

Through: Mr. Subhash Chandran KR. versus MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS AND ANR. ..... Respondent

> Through: Ms. Nidhi Mohan Parashar and Mr. Vikrant Kumar, Advs. for R-2. Mr. Dev P. Bhardwaj, CGSC with Ms. Anubha Bhardwaj, Mr. Sachin Singh and Ms. Divyanshi Srivastava, Advs. for R-2.

## CORAM: HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SUBRAMONIUM PRASAD

%

**ORDER** 18.05.2023

1. The Petitioner before this Court has filed the present writ petition as a Public Interest Litigation espousing the cause of specially abled people. The Petitioner has prayed for the following reliefs:

"i.Issue a writ/order/direction in the nature of mandamus or any other appropriate writ / order to set aside Commercial Circular No. 18 of 2015 bearing No. 2011/TG-I/10-e-ticketing for disables/Pt.I, New Delhi dated 19.03.2015 issued by the Respondent No.l, Indian Railway and also direct the Respondent No.l, Indian Railway to validate the UDID cards issued under the mandate of the RPD Act, 2016 for concession based ticketing for physically challenged (disabled) persons in compliance with article 14, 21 of the constitution of India and natural justice; and

*ii. Pass any other order as this Hon'ble Court may deem fit and proper in the interest of justice.* "

2. The relief clause relates to grant of certain concessions in the matter of booking of tickets for physically challenged (disabled) persons. A detailed and exhaustive reply has been filed in the matter by Union of India.

3. The reply reveals that the Railways has extended concession in fare to more than 50 categories of passengers which includes 4 categories of Divyang Passengers, 11 type of patients, senior citizens, press correspondents, war widows, sports persons, etc. and the concession varies from 10% to 100%.

4. The relevant paragraphs of the affidavit filed by the Railways read as under:

"1. That as a welfare measure. Railway extends concession in passenger fare to more than 50 categories of passengers. There are 4 categories of Divyang passengers, 11 types of, patients, senior citizens. Press correspondents, war widows, sports persons etc. The element of concession varies from 10% to 100%. The detailed list of different categories of persons eligible for concession is Annexure-A-1.

2. That the Indian Railways grant concession to persons with disabilities (Divyangjan) in extreme cases only. As per extant Railway rules, the following categories of persons with disabilities (Divyangjan) are granted concession in passenger fares:-

Sl No.	Divyang Passengers		
	Categories	Class and element of concession	As per available record introduced w.e.f.
1	Orthopaedically Handicapped/	• 75% in	Orthopaedically Handicapped

Paraplegic persons who cannot travel without escort - *for any purpose $2^{nd}$ , SL, $1^{st}$ w.e.f. 28.08.1961 persons: 23.04.19852Mentally retarded cannot travel without escort - *for any persons who cannot travel without escort - *for any purposeOI.01.19872Mentally retarded without escort - *for any purposeCar 20% in 1AC 2AC, *for any purposeOI.01.19872Mentally retarded without escort - *for any purposeCar 2AC, 2AC, *for any purposeOI.01.19873Cannot travel without escort - *for any purposeSolve in AC AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trainsPrior to 19583Person with visual is also impairment with total absence of sight alsence of sight and concession.Prior to 19584Person with an secort - for any purposeSolve in Solve in01.06.1985				
cannot travel without escort - *for any purposeClass, 3AC, AC chair CarParaplegic persons: 23.04.19852Mentally retarded persons who cannot travel without escort - *for any purposeCar 2AC, and 2AC, *for any purpose01.01.19872Mentally retarded without escort - *for any purposeCar 2AC, and 2S% in 3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains01.01.19873Person with visual impairment with total absence of sight traveling alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 19583Person with visual impairment alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958		Paraplegic		w.e.f.
without escort - *for any purpose 3AC, AC persons: 23.04.1985   2 Mentally Car 01.01.1987   2 Mentally 50% in 1AC   persons who JAC 01.01.1987   cannot travel and 2AC,   *for any 25% in 3AC &   purpose 3AC & AC AC   *for any 25% in 3AC &   purpose 3AC & AC AC   *for any 25% in 3AC &   purpose 3AC & AC AC   Chair Car of Rajdha ni/   Shata bdi trains 50% in   MST & QST in First and   Second Class Second Class   3 Person with One escort Prior to 1958   is also inpairment eligible for same   absence of sight element of concession. and   alone or with an escort - for any purpose <th></th> <th>persons who</th> <th><math>1^{st}</math></th> <th></th>		persons who	$1^{st}$	
*foranyAC23.04.19852Mentally retarded persons who cannot travel without escort - *for50% in 1AC and 2AC,01.01.1987*forany purpose3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains01.01.19873Person who cannot travel without escort - *for purpose3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains93Person with visual impairment with total absence of sight traveling alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958		cannot travel	Class,	Paraplegic
purposechair Car2Mentally retarded persons who cannot travel without escort - *for any purpose50% in IAC and 2AC, • 25% in 3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains01.01.19873Person with QST in First and Second ClassPrior to 19583Person with visual impairment with total absnee of sight alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958		without escort –		1
2Mentally retarded persons who cannot travel without escort - *for any purposeCar01.01.1987*for any purpose.50% in 1AC and 2AC, * 25% in 3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains.50% in 3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains.01.01.19873Person with visual impairment with total absence of sight travelling alone or with an escort - for any purpose.01.01.1987		*for any	AC	23.04.1985
2Mentally retarded persons who cannot travel without escort - *for any purposeCar01.01.19872AC, *for any purpose- 50% in IAC and 2AC, Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains- 625% in 3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains- 7000000000000000000000000000000000000		purpose	chair	
retarded persons who cannot travel without escort - *for purpose50% in IAC and 2AC,*for any purpose2AC,*for any purpose3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains50% in MST & QST in First and Second ClassPrior to 19583Person with total absence of sight traveling alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958	2		Car	01.01.1987
personswho cannotIAC and 2AC,*forany purpose2AC,*forany purpose25% in 3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains3Personwith out oneOne escort eligible for same eligible for same element of concession.3Personwith out oneOne escort escort3Personwith one escort eligible for samePrior to 1958		-	• 50% in	
cannot travel without escort - *for any purposeand 2AC,*for any purpose25% in 3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains*for any purpose50% in MST & QST in First and Second Class3Person with visual impairment with total absence of sight and escort - for any purpose3Person with an escort - for any purpose		persons who	IAC	
*forany purpose25% in 3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains3Personwith total and Second ClassPrior to 19583Personwith total asme absence of sight travelling alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958		<u>^</u>	and	
*forany purpose25% in 3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains3Personwith total and Second ClassPrior to 19583Personwith total asme absence of sight travelling alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958		without escort -	2AC,	
purpose3AC & AC Chair Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains3Person with visual impairment absence of sight absence of sight and same elegible for with total asame absence of sight and same element of concession.Prior to 19583Person with total asame absence of sight and or with an escort for any purposePrior to 1958		*for any		
AC   Chair   Car of   Rajdha   ni/   Shata   bdi   trains   • 50% in   MST &   QST in   First   and   Second   Class   3 Person with   one escort   prior to 1958   is also   impairment   eligible for   with total   absence of sight   element of   travelling   alone or with   an escort - for   any purpose		•		
3Person with visual impairment absence of sight alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 19583Person with visual and classOne escort eligible for same element of concession.Prior to 1958				
Car of Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trainsShata bdi trainsShata bdi trainsSolution of the second ClassSPerson with visual inpairment with total absence of sight and classSPerson with total asame absence of sight and classAPerson visual is also impairment and classAPerson visual is also impairment absence of sight an escort - for any purpose				
Rajdha ni/ Shata bdi trains50% in MST & QST in First and Second Class3Person with visual impairment with total absence of sight alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958				
ni/ni/Shatabditrains50% inMST &QST inFirstandSecondClass			•	
Shata bdi trainsbdi trains50% in MST & QST in First and Second Class3Person with visual is also impairment with total absence of sight travelling alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958			-	
bdi trains• 50% in MST & QST in First and Second Class3Person with visual impairment with total absence of sight alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958				
Image: strain series of sight an escort - for any purposetrainstrains50% in MST & QST in First and Second ClassImage: strain series of sight an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958train series of sight an escort - for any purposeImage: strain series of sight and series of se				
• 50% in MST & QST in First and Second Class3Person with visual impairment with total absence of sight travelling alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958				
MST & QST in First and Second ClassMST & QST in First and Second Class3Person with visual impairment with total absence of sight alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958				
QST in First and Second ClassPerson visualPrior to 19583Person with visualOne escort is also eligible for same element of travelling alone or with an escort - for any purposePrior to 1958				
FirstandSecondClassPerson withOne escortvisualis alsoimpairmenteligible forwith totalabsence of sightelement oftravellingalone or withan escort - forany purpose				
and Second ClassPerson Visualand Second Class3Person with visualOne escort is alsoPrior to 1958impairment with totaleligible for same element of concession.Prior to 1958alone or with an escort - for any purposeend under the same concession.Prior to 1958			~	
Second Class3Person with visualOne escort is alsoPrior to 1958impairment with total absence of sight travelling alone or with an escort - for any purposeelement of concession.Impairment is also				
ClassPerson with visualOne escort is alsoPrior to 1958impairment with totaleligible for same element of travelling alone or with an escort - for any purposeelement of concession.				
3Person with visualOne escort is alsoPrior to 1958impairment with absence of sight travelling alone or with an escort - for any purposeOne escort elescort eligible for same element of concession.Prior to 1958				
visualisalsoimpairmenteligible forwithtotalabsence of sightelement oftravellingconcession.alone or withan escort - forany purpose	2	Dougon with		Dui ou to 1059
impairmenteligible forwithtotalsameabsence of sightelement oftravellingconcession.alone or withan escort - forany purposeunits of the same	3			Prior to 1930
withtotalsameabsence of sightelement oftravellingconcession.alone or withan escort - forany purpose				
absence of sight travellingelement of concession.alone or with an escort - for any purpose		_		
travelling concession. alone or with an escort - for any purpose				
alone or with an escort - for any purpose			v	
an escort - for any purpose		0	concession.	
any purpose				
4 Person with • 50% in 01.06.1985				01.04.1005
	4	Person with	• 50% in	01.06.1985

Hearing and	$2^{nd}$ , SL	
Speech	and 1 <sup>st</sup>	
Impairment	Class	
totally (Both	• 50% in	
afflictions	MST &	
together in the	QST in	
same person)	first	
travelling alone	and	
or with an	second	
escort – for any	class	
purpose.	One escort	
	is also	
	eligible for	
	same	
	element of	
	concession	
	concession	

10. That it is pointed out here that revenue foregone due to concession being given to different categories of passengers are borne by Indian Railways. The total revenue foregone due to concession being given to different categories of passengers during 2018-19 is 1995 Crore. Out of these approximately Rs.137 Crores has been forgone for giving concession to only four categories of Divyangjan.

11. That the revenue foregone due to concession being given to Divyangjan during last four financial years are as under:-

Category		Year		
	2015-	2016-	2017-	2018-
	16	17	18	19
Persons	107.13	109.35	125.24	136.95
with				
Disabilities				

(Rupees in Crores) (Approximate)

Source CRIS

19. That out of the above 22 categories, Railways provide concession to only four, categories of persons with disabilities that too in extreme cases. The eligible persons can travel unlimited journey from anywhere to anywhere and for any

purpose. The lists are re summarized as under:-

1. Orthopaedically Handicapped/ Paraplegic persons who cannot travel without escort-Unlimited journey for any purpose.

2.Mentally retarded persons who cannot travel without escort -Unlimited journey for any purpose.

3.Person with Visual Impairment with total absence of sight travelling alone or with an escort - Unlimited journey for any purpose.

4. Person with Hearing and Speech Impairment totally (Both afflictions together in the same person) travelling alone or with an escort - Unlimited journey for any purpose.

20. That apart from above, concessions are also given to 4 additional categories as mentioned in RPWD ACT 2016 1 Leprosy-(non *infectious*) 2. Sickle Cell Anaemia 3. Haemophillia 4. Thalassemia. But these concession are given only from residence to hospital and return on the, recommendation and certificate issued by doctors of the hospital. The certificates are valid only for onward and return journey. Unlimited journey, from anywhere to anywhere, for any purpose facilities similar to persons with disabilities are not provided in these cases. The concession In applicable classes and element of concessions for these four categories of passengers are as under:-

pussengers are as and	,	
Category of	<i>Element</i> of	Purpose for which
Patients	concession	concession is
		admissible
1. Non-infectious	75%	When called by
Leprosy patients.	concession in	recognised hospital
	Second, Sleeper	for treatment or
	& First	check-up and return
	class.	_
2. Sickle cell	50% In	When called by the
Anaemia	Sleeper, AC	recognized hospital
	Chair Car, AC	' for
	3-tier and AC	treatment/periodical
	2-tier classes	check-up
3. Patients	75%	When called by

suffering from severe/moderate form of Hemophilia, when travelling alone or with an escort.	concession in Second, Sleeper, First, AC Chair Car, 3 AC classes One escort is also eligible for the same element of	recognised hospital for treatment or check-up and return.
4. Thalassemia patients travelling alone or with an escort.	concession.75% in II, SL,1, AC CC & 3AC and 50% in2 AC & 1 AC .One escort isalso eligible forthe sameelement ofconcession.	When called by recognised hospital for treatment or check-up and return.

21. That in addition to the same the Railways also provide concession to 7 more categories of patients which are not listed in the RPWD Act 2016, which are as under:-

Category of	Element of	Purpose for which
Patients	concession	concession is admissible
1. Cancer patients travelling alone or with an escort.	100% concession in Sleeper, SAC and 75% concession in II I and AC CC and 50% in 2AC & 1 AC . One escorts is also eligible for 75% concession in II, SL, I, AC CC&	When called by recognised hospital for treatment or check-up and return.

	3 AC and 50%	
	<i>in 2 AC &amp; I AC.</i>	
2. Heart	75% in II, SL, I,	When called by
patients	AC CC & 3 AC	recognised hospital
travelling alone	and 50% in 2	for heart surgery
or with an	AC & 1 AC .	and return.
escort.	One escort is	
	also eligible for	
	the same	
	element of	
	concession.	
3. Kidney	75% in II, SL, I,	When called by
patients	AC CC & 3 AC	recognised hospital
travelling alone	and 50% in 2	for Kidney
or with an	AC & 1 AC. One	Transplant
escort.	escort is also	Operation or
	eligible for the	Dialysis and return.
	same element of	
	concession.	
4. T.B./Lupas	75% concession	When called by
Valgaris	in Second,	recognised hospital
patients	Sleeper & First	for treatment or
travelling alone	class. One	check-up and
or with an	escort is also	return.
escort.	eligible for the	
	same element of	
	concession.	
5. Aids patients	50% concession	When called by the
-	in second class	ART Centres for
		treatment checkup,
		and return.
6. Aplastic	50% In Sleeper,	When called by the
Anaemia	AC Chair Car,	recognized hospital
	AC 3-tier and	for
	AC 2-tier	treatment/periodical
	classes	check-up
7 Ostomy	50% in MSI &	Travelling for any
patients -	QST	purpose.

26. That it is further submitted that the mandate for allowing concession in passenger fare as per RPWD Act lies with department of empowerment of persons with disabilities, Ministry of social justice and empowerment therefore Ministry of social justice and empowerment may decide the same and Railways will provide full assistance in implementation of the same. "

5. Section 58 of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities Act, 2016 provides for certification in respect of persons having disability. Section 58 of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities Act, 2016 reads as under:

"(1) Any person with specified disability, may apply, in such manner as may be prescribed by the Central Government, to a certifying authority having jurisdiction, for issuing of a certificate of disability.

(2) On receipt of an application under sub-section (1), the certifying authority shall assess the disability of the concerned person in accordance with relevant guidelines notified under section 56, and shall, after such assessment, as the case may be,—

(a) issue a certificate of disability to such person, in such form as may be prescribed by the Central Government;

(b) inform him in writing that he has no specified disability.

(3) The certificate of disability issued under this section shall be valid across the country."

6. The aforesaid statutory provision of law makes it very clear that the certificate is issued certifying the disability and the certificate is valid across India.

7. The Railways has issued a circular dated 19.03.2015 and in order to ensure that disabled persons are not required to submit their disability certificate each and every time while buying a ticket, a policy decision has

been taken by the Railways to issue a Photo Identity Card for the purpose of purchase of tickets and the Photo Identity Card is issued on the basis of certificate if disability issued under Section 58 of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities Act, 2016.

8. In the considered opinion of this Court, the procedure adopted by the Railways is a fair and transparent procedure and in fact, the circular dated 19.03.2015 has been issued by the Railways to ensure that a disabled person is not required to show the disability certificate every time while buying a ticket.

9. This Court does not find any reason to interfere with the circular dated 19.03.2015 issued by the Railways and, therefore, no further orders are required to be passed in the present PIL and the same stands disposed of accordingly.

#### SATISH CHANDRA SHARMA, CJ

#### SUBRAMONIUM PRASAD, J

MAY 18, 2023 N.Khanna